

Message

From: Cisar, Elizabeth [Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Sent: 10/8/2021 5:23:50 PM
To: Fox, Radhika [Fox.Radhika@epa.gov]; Wehling, Carrie [Wehling.Carrie@epa.gov]; Pollins, Mark [Pollins.Mark@epa.gov]; Niebling, William [Niebling.William@epa.gov]
Subject: FW: Update on Filter Study

For awareness.

Elizabeth Cisar
Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov
Phone: (202)-564-4382; Cell: Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

From: Newton, Cheryl <Newton.Cheryl@epa.gov>
Sent: Friday, October 8, 2021 1:07 PM
To: Cisar, Elizabeth <Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Fong, Tera <Fong.Tera@epa.gov>; Wadlington, Christina <Wadlington.Christina@epa.gov>; McLain, Jennifer L. <McLain.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Murray, Regan <Murray.Regan@epa.gov>; Kelley, Jeff <kelley.jeff@epa.gov>; Kaplan, Robert <kaplan.robert@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Update on Filter Study

Hi everyone – I am reverting back to this chain that includes ORD for the purpose of my today update. Please share as appropriate or let me know if I should add others to this “core” group. Bottom line is I believe we have some progress/next steps consistent with our discussion yesterday.

- Aaron agrees that a meeting among EPA and MI (EGLE and DHHS) to go over the science is a critical next step. This would be the opportunity to address and hopefully close any gaps in our messaging about bottled water and filters. I told him we’d aim for next week, Wednesday or Thursday ideally. He will manage MI’s participation stressing the importance of flexing to attend, and asked I send some options of availability next week. I’m happy to myself or with my assistant try to identify such options however ORD is key. Perhaps if Regan could identify options they are available, then the rest of us could determine who else is critical among our larger group and hopefully come up with 2-3 options. Regan – Does that sound ok?
- I stressed the need for MI to provide written documentation of its bottled water distribution plan and related materials/instructions that go with the bottled water. Aaron indicated part of their struggle is the need for on-going changes to address challenges such as bottled spring water shortages (possible move to distilled), truck and driver shortages (possible move to state drivers/trucks) and space. I noted that regardless of on-going updates, it’s hard to imagine providing bottled water to a city without a written “plan” of some kind; that we want what they have along with any communications materials. Follow-up here is Tera will reach out to her EGLE colleague Amy, whom Aaron will have given this message.

Those are the key points. Let me know if you have any questions. As noted, for the scheduling of the science meeting, I’ll await hearing first from Regan/ORD. Thanks!

From: Newton, Cheryl
Sent: Thursday, October 7, 2021 10:57 AM
To: Cisar, Elizabeth <Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Fong, Tera <Fong.Tera@epa.gov>; Wadlington, Christina <Wadlington.Christina@epa.gov>; McLain, Jennifer L. <McLain.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Murray, Regan <Murray.Regan@epa.gov>; Kelley, Jeff <kelley.jeff@epa.gov>; Kaplan, Robert <kaplan.robert@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Update on Filter Study

Hi Elizabeth, everyone – I had a quick chat with Aaron. I would say the message is received about better coordination. Aaron did remind that the email I sent to him which this team reviewed indicated our commitment to do a study, however I re-emphasized that absent the context of the Agency message on filters the state's statement opened the door to considerable miscommunication/misunderstanding about our overall message on filters which is now having to be addressed. The meeting we will be having to discuss the science/foundation of our statement will be really important for EGLE and especially DHHS. I can speak more to this if we have our check in this afternoon but Aaron indicated DHHS may still be hesitant to restart the filter distribution planning even with EPA's statement because of the reference to "evaluating and taking action to confirm....." Perhaps we don't wait until that collective meeting to have a first discussion with DHHS. Have to run to a meeting, but wanted to get this out. Thanks

From: Cisar, Elizabeth <Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Sent: Thursday, October 7, 2021 10:05 AM

To: Newton, Cheryl <Newton.Cheryl@epa.gov>

Cc: Fong, Tera <Fong.Tera@epa.gov>; Wadlington, Christina <Wadlington.Christina@epa.gov>; McLain, Jennifer L. <McLain.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Murray, Regan <Murray.Regan@epa.gov>; Kelley, Jeff <kelley.jeff@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: Update on Filter Study

Cheryl:

Yes, the goal is to keep this focused on a quick update on what we're doing (I'll use the high level note we provided Radhika as a reference doc) and discuss scheduling and scope of filter study meeting.

BTW, can you let me know how the conversations with EGLE and DHHS went? Based on your read of those conversations, let me know if I should try to call Elizabeth Hertel from MDHHS today.

Elizabeth Cisar

Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov

Phone: (202)-564-4382; Cell:

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

From: Newton, Cheryl <Newton.Cheryl@epa.gov>

Sent: Thursday, October 7, 2021 10:57 AM

To: Cisar, Elizabeth <Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Cc: Fong, Tera <Fong.Tera@epa.gov>; Wadlington, Christina <Wadlington.Christina@epa.gov>; McLain, Jennifer L. <McLain.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Murray, Regan <Murray.Regan@epa.gov>; Kelley, Jeff <kelley.jeff@epa.gov>

Subject: FW: Update on Filter Study

Hi Elizabeth – How can we best approach/support below. Is the idea still you would try to keep a today conversation focused on the statement and the offer of having the deeper dive meeting next week? Thanks

From: Sylvia Orduño <smorduno@>

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Sent: Thursday, October 7, 2021 9:04 AM

To: Elin Betanzo <elin@safewaterengineering.com>

Cc: Cisar, Elizabeth <Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Nicholas.Leonard <nicholas.leonard@glelc.org>; Wadlington, Christina <Wadlington.Christina@epa.gov>; Fong, Tera <Fong.Tera@epa.gov>; Walts, Alan <walts.alan@epa.gov>; Newton, Cheryl <Newton.Cheryl@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: Update on Filter Study

Thank you, Elizabeth for the follow up and urgent concerns.

I completely concur with Elin. We read and heard more troubling claims from EGLE yesterday in an EJ meeting where they sought to explain and seek support for their public statements.

Based off Elizabeth's availability, I can meet today 3:30-4pm, after 6pm; tomorrow from 12-12:30pm or after 5:30pm.

We're in the middle of much response work and preparation for Saturday's community lead education & emergency petition update event in Benton Harbor.

Regards,
Sylvia

On Thu, Oct 7, 2021 at 9:38 AM Elin Betanzo <elin@safewaterengineering.com> wrote:

Thank you for including me Elizabeth,

I'd like to point out that the messaging below is inconsistent with the messaging from MDHHS yesterday. It will be unfortunate to have contradictory messages out in the community now that a real response on the ground is finally starting to assemble. Can we please have a discussion on the language and EPA's recommendation on the role of filters in the immediate response in Benton Harbor before this gets published?

Elin

On Thu, Oct 7, 2021 at 9:20 AM Cisar, Elizabeth <Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov> wrote:

Looping in Elin Betanzo – meant to include her in the original note.

Elizabeth Cisar

Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov

Phone: (202)-564-4382; Cell: Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

From: Cisar, Elizabeth

Sent: Thursday, October 7, 2021 8:54 AM

To: Nicholas.Leonard <nicholas.leonard@glelc.org>; Sylvia Orduño <smorduno@Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>

Cc: Wadlington, Christina <Wadlington.Christina@epa.gov>; Tera Fong (Fong.Tera@epa.gov) <Fong.Tera@epa.gov>;
Walts, Alan <walts.alan@epa.gov>; Cheryl Newton (Newton.Cheryl@epa.gov) <Newton.Cheryl@epa.gov>

Subject: Update on Filter Study

Hi Sylvia and Nick:

I wanted to let you know that because of media reports about the filter study, EPA is releasing a statement today. The statement is below. We did not expect there to be public statements to the media about the filter study yesterday and given some of the statements in the reporting, we felt an immediate response was needed. We had planned to be in contact with you about the filter study before any public communication.

I would like to update you and the rest of the petitioners about EPA's plans to conduct a filter study and to arrange a meeting with the interested petitioners, EPA's research team, and EGLE to talk about the study design and scope. Right now, I understand that you, Sylvia, Elin, Ben Pauli, and Jill Ryan would like to be part of that meeting.

I know you have a series of other items that you also want to discuss in detail. Although I don't have all the information you have requested, I'd welcome the chance to update you on what we know at this point.

I'm available today between 1-4 or after 5:30 ET. Tomorrow I could talk before 9:15, between 11-12:30 ET, or after 4:00 ET.

I look forward to speaking with you.

PUBLIC HEALTH STATEMENT

Michigan is making available and distributing free bottled water to all residents in Benton Harbor. Residents without water filters should use bottled water for cooking, drinking, brushing teeth, rinsing foods and mixing powdered infant formula. Filters have been available and the State will distribute filters and provide educational materials to show appropriate use and operation of the filters. EPA encourages Benton Harbor residents to take steps to protect themselves from lead in drinking water which may include consuming bottled water and/or using water filters.

ACCOMPANYING FILTER STATEMENT

Certified filters that are properly installed and maintained are very effective in reducing lead concentrations in drinking water, according to the most recent science and studies. In Benton Harbor, EPA urges residents to use filters as recommended and follow relevant state guidance. EPA will work with the state, as needed, to support the development of educational materials on filter use.

Out of an abundance of caution, EPA is evaluating the state of the science and taking action to confirm Benton Harbor data to further understand filter effectiveness in relation to Benton Harbor's specific water chemistry. This study is one of the many ways that EPA is working with the community, local and state partners, to evaluate public health risks from lead exposure. The agency will continue to be involved to support and monitor the effectiveness of the immediate interventions and development of long-term solutions in Benton Harbor.

CITATIONS

1. Lead Particle Size Fractionation and Identification in Newark, New Jersey's Drinking Water Darren A. Lytle, Michael R. Schock, Casey Formal, Christina Bennett-Stamper, Stephen Harmon, Mallikarjuna N. Nadagouda, Daniel Williams, Michael K. DeSantis, Jennifer Tully, and Maily Pham Environmental Science & Technology 2020 54 (21), 13672-13679
2. POU water filters effectively reduce lead in drinking water: a demonstration field study in flint, Michigan. Bosscher V, Lytle DA, Schock MR, Porter A, Del Toral M. J Environ Sci Health A Tox Hazard Subst Environ Eng. 2019;54(5):484-493
3. Effectiveness of point-of-use and pitcher filters at removing lead phosphate nanoparticles from drinking water. Evelyne Doré, Casey Formal, Christy Muhlen, Daniel Williams, Stephen Harmon, Maily Pham, Simoni Triantafyllidou, Darren A. Lytle, Water Research, Volume 201, 2021, 117285, ISSN 0043-1354, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2021.117285>.

Elizabeth Cisar (she, her)

Senior Advisor, Office of Water

US Environmental Protection Agency

Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov

Phone: (202)-564-4382; Cell: Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

--

Elin Warn Betanzo
Safe Water Engineering, LLC
@SafeWaterEng, www.safewaterengineering.com
248-326-4339